

ELAINE M. ARBOUR, Ed.D.
Superintendent of Schools
e.arbour@dover.k12.nh.us

LIBBY M. SIMMONS
Business Administrator
l.simmons@dover.k12.nh.us



CHRISTINE BOSTON
Director of Pupil Personnel Services
c.boston@dover.k12.nh.us

PAULA GLYNN
Director of Curriculum, Instruction and Assessment
p.glynn@dover.k12.nh.us

JEFFREY MYERS
Director of Technology
j.myers@dover.k12.nh.us

THE DOVER SCHOOL DISTRICT

SCHOOL ADMINISTRATIVE UNIT #11
McCONNELL CENTER
61 LOCUST STREET SUITE 409
DOVER, NEW HAMPSHIRE 03820-4132
TEL (603) 516-6800
FAX (603) 516-6809

TO: Members Dover School Board
FROM: Elaine M. Arbour, Superintendent of Schools
DATE: January 9, 2017
RE: Award for *Student Transportation Services*

On October 28, 2016, the District solicited a public bid seeking proposals from qualified student transportation management companies to provide daily transportation services for in-district regular education starting July 1, 2017. The District requested proposals for a three-year contract with an option for a one or two-year extension. Four vendors were present for the mandatory pre-proposal meeting on October 15th and two vendors submitted a proposal on November 9, 2016. Results are as follows:

Regular Routes – OPTION A

Comparison of First Student (FS) and Student Transportation of New Hampshire (STA) – 22 New Buses with FS and STA

Vendor	Number of Buses	Daily Rate Year 1	Daily Rate Year 2	Daily Rate Year 3	Annual Total Year 1	Annual Total Year 2	Annual Total Year 3	3-Year Savings
FS	22 New (84 Capacity)	\$402.68	\$420.80	\$439.74	\$1,568,036	\$1,638,595	\$1,712,348	
STA	22 New (77 Capacity)	\$386.95	\$398.56	\$410.52	\$1,506,783	\$1,551,993	\$1,598,565	
STA Annual Savings					\$61,253	\$86,602	\$113,783	\$261,638

Regular Routes – OPTION B

Comparison of First Student (FS) Alternate Proposal and Student Transportation of New Hampshire (STA) – 11 New Buses in Year 1 with FS and 22 New Buses with STA

Vendor	Number of Buses	Daily Rate Year 1	Daily Rate Year 2	Daily Rate Year 3	Annual Total Year 1	Annual Total Year 2	Annual Total Year 3	3-Year Savings
FS	11 New (84 Capacity)	\$375.78	\$392.69	\$410.36	\$1,463,287	\$1,529,135	\$1,597,942	
STA	22 New (77 Capacity)	\$386.95	\$398.56	\$410.52	\$1,506,783	\$1,551,993	\$1,598,565	
FS Annual Savings					\$43,496	\$22,858	\$623	\$66,977

Dover School District Mission Statement

Strengthening our community by educating every child, every day!

Fuel Adjustment Rates (range for the duration of contract)

Vendor	Diesel Fuel	Gasoline Fuel
First Student	\$2.62 to \$2.89	N/A
Student Transportation Of New Hampshire	\$2.40 to \$2.80	\$1.70 to \$2.10

The District is currently using First Student on a contractual basis for in-district regular education transportation, and the fleet consists of twenty-two (22), eighty-four (84) capacity buses. We are providing two options to the Board this evening. Below is a breakdown by provider of what we believe is relevant information in making your decision.

First Student

- Alternate proposal (11 new 84-passenger buses, with older buses phased out in Year 2), offers an annual savings in Year 1 of \$43,496 as compared to STA's proposal and a 19% or \$233,640 increase over the current FY2017 contract.
- Current provider with known service record.

Student Transportation Services of New Hampshire

- Twenty-two (22) new 77-passenger bus proposal offers an annual savings in Year 1 of \$61,253 as compared to First Student's proposal using twenty-two (22) new 84-passenger buses. In Year 1, the proposal would be a 22.5% or \$277,136 increase over the current First Student FY2017 contract.
- Price adjustments for different size buses if used in the fleet.
- Optional mobile app that connects parents and school officials to the vehicles transporting their students (a fee to households would apply).

Based on analysis of the bid proposals, my recommendation would be to select First Student's Alternate Proposal (Option B) as it offers a lower cost while maintaining our current level of service, which has improved over the course of this school year. However, if the Board's priority is to replace the entire fleet in Year 1 with all new buses, I would be comfortable recommending Student Transportation of New Hampshire's proposal.

District Questions to Student Transportation Vendors

First Student, Dave Fairweather, Area General Manager

Q1. Are you able to provide information on employee wages and benefits?

A2. See Attachment A

Q2. In First Student's Alternate Proposal, will the eleven new buses be used as part of the daily 22 route buses? In Year 2, will the sixteen 2009 buses be phased out with new buses?

A2. Yes. We would also be using all 84 passenger type units; no blend of sizes as proposed by STA.

Student Transportation of New Hampshire (STA), Gregg Stinson, Vice-President of Operations

Q1. Are you able to provide information on employee wages and benefits?

A1. STA's intent is to recognize the local bargaining unit (Teamsters 633) to negotiate a competitive wage and benefit program.

WAGE SCHEDULE I

Bus Drivers:

Years of Service on:	9/01/17	09/01/18	09/01/19	04/01/20
Driver	\$20.80	\$21.35	\$21.75	\$22.15

Q2. What is the cost of SafeStop? And is the cost to the family and/or the District?

A2. The cost of SafeStop would be \$9.70 per month per bus for unlimited subscriptions for parents and administrators. SafeStop can be offered to families of students at subscription cost of \$3.99 per month per household.

Q3. The fleet summary provided in the proposal states 20 route buses and 2 spares. We are currently utilizing 22 route buses. Would you please provide additional clarification?

A3. The fleet summary was based upon the specifications. We will operate as many route buses with sufficient spares required by the Dover School District.

Q4. Do you have any current letters of recommendation?

A4. In regard to updated reference letters, we try and update them every few years to avoid disrupting our customers, however, would recommend that you refer to our customer listing and contact any customers either close geographically or similar size for reference.

Q5. Please confirm the signature date on the proposal as 11/2/15 is noted.

A5. The signature page was dated at the top of the page as 12/6/16 and signed as of that date. My apology for missing the 11/2/15 date at the bottom of the page (we utilized the same pricing form from last year's bid).

Q6. The bid specifications note 84-passenger vehicles. In a prior email, you noted that you would be able to provide this size vehicle to routes where necessary. Would you please verify the number of buses, as well as the cost, if any?

A6. Our proposal is inclusive of a new 2017 model-77 passenger fleet. We based this capacity as a result of the service concerns heard from the school committee at last year's award meeting – specifically in relation to the extended length in time of the routes. We believe that a majority of routes could benefit from the significantly less expensive 77 Passenger Conventional Style vs 83 Passenger Transit Style buses. We would welcome the opportunity to meet and review the routes specific to current ridership and in the event that you would require more than a few 83 passenger buses, we could provide you with the cost differential to purchase 83 passenger buses by need.

WAGE SCHEDULE I

Bus Drivers:

Years of Service on:	Current	7/01/15	09/01/16	9/01/17	09/01/18	09/01/19	04/01/20
Probation*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Driver	\$19.50	\$19.90	\$20.30	\$20.80	\$21.35	\$21.75	\$22.15
Lead Driver		\$20.40	\$20.80	\$21.35	\$21.90	\$22.30	\$22.70

Employer may hire for the first ninety (90) days of employment at a probationary rate \$1 per hour less than full rate.

Lead Driver shall have a guarantee of forty (40) hours per week during the school year and twenty-five (25) hours per week during the Summer months.

**Any employee earning a greater hourly rate than the scheduled rate in any category will receive a 2% increase on the rate they are paid each year or the scheduled rate, whichever is greater.

A part-time office position shall be made available, if needed, as determined by management, to employees covered under this agreement. The parties agree that they may select the most senior qualified employee.

Driver Trainers shall receive a premium of one dollar (\$1.00) per hour above their normal hourly rate while training.

Non-Revenue Rate:	Years 1 and 2 = \$11.00
	Years 3 and 4 = \$11.50
	Year 5 = \$12.00

Driver Safety Bonus:

The Company agrees to provide a driver bonus of fifty-five (\$55.00) dollars per month. Year four this shall increase to sixty dollars (\$60.00) per month. Year 5 this shall increase to sixty-five (\$65.00) dollars per month. Drivers shall be allowed to miss one run a month, excluding bereavement leave as outlined in the contract and approved FMLA leave. A run is defined as one AM or one PM run. June bonus monies to be paid with the last pay period of June each year. Bonuses are to be divided 50% for safety and 50% for attendance.

WAGE SCHEDULE II

Longevity Pay beginning 9/2010:

\$5.00 per week after five (5) years	\$10.00 per week after ten (10) years
\$15.00 per week after fifteen (15) years	\$20.00 per week after twenty (20) years
\$25.00 per week after twenty-five (25) years	\$30.00 per week after thirty (30) years

Health Benefits:

The Employer shall pay Seventy (70%) percent of the cost of the Health Insurance for all employees for single coverage who have been employed from zero to five years. The Employer shall also pay eighty (80%) percent of the cost of Health Insurance for single coverage for employees who have been employed more than five (5) years. This payment shall be made to the Healthcare fund of the employee's choosing.

If, at any point, the Northern New England Benefit Trust fails to continue to meet the requirements of the Affordable Care Act, the Company will, if required, offer an additional compliant health care plan to all employees eligible for such coverage as required by law.

Should any insurance plan(s) required under this CBA subject the Employer to an excise tax under Federal or State law, the parties agree to immediately re-open this CBA for the limited purpose of negotiating an alternative plan(s) that will not be subject to the excise tax

Unemployment Benefits:

The Company will follow all unemployment guidelines as forth in State regulations.

Life Insurance Benefits:

The Employer agrees to provide twenty-five thousand (\$25,000.00) dollars life insurance to employees at no cost. The Employer agrees to provide a twenty-five thousand (\$25,000.00) dollar AD & D to employees at no cost.

Meal Reimbursement:

The Company will provide reimbursement meal money for charter drivers working over eight (8) hours on charter. The allowance shall be fifteen (\$15.00) dollars. Receipts shall be provided by the employee. Effective 9/01/15 this shall increase to twenty dollars (\$20.00) and effective 9/01/16 this shall increase to twenty-five dollars (\$25.00)

401K Benefit Plan:

Effective upon ratification, the Company shall match Employee contributions, at a rate of one hundred fifty percent (150%) on the first three hundred dollars (\$300) of employee contribution per year per participant. Effective year 3 this shall increase to three hundred and twenty-five dollars (\$325.00). Effective year 5 this shall increase to three hundred fifty dollars (\$350.00). All employees who participate in this fund shall have their contributions and corresponding match sent to New England Teamsters Savings and Investment Plan.

Bereavement Leave:

All non-probationary employees shall be granted up to three (3) days off to either attend or make arrangements, including the funeral, to settle the estate, but not to exceed three (3) days for a member of the employee's immediate family. Immediate family is defined as an employee's spouse, child, mother, father, brother, and/or sister, grandchild, grandparents, mother-in-law/father-in-law, and domestic partner. It is also agreed that in order to be paid, the employee must take the time off with no exceptions to this Article. The Company shall have the right to request proof of death of such relative. After three (3) days of employment, (1) day only will be paid to attend the funeral of the employee's grandparents and parents-in-law. It is also the understanding of the parties that during any vacation period during the school year, no bereavement benefit will be given to any employee unless said employee is working the Laidlaw during the week that a death in the family may occur.

Snow Days:

In the event that school is canceled because of snow, each regular driver, including any stand-by drivers scheduled to work that day, shall be entitled to compensation for their A.M. run when said driver has not had the benefit of at least a thirty (30) minute notice prior to report time of such cancellation. Snow days cannot be accumulated nor paid for in lieu of. Snow days are limited to five (5) per school year. (May accrue from year to year for actual snow day use only – no payments for unused snow days.)

Bus Ridership, October 2016

BUS #	DHS AM	DHS PM	DMS AM	DMS PM	GES AM	GES PM	WPS AM	WPS PM	HSS AM	HSS PM
D01	31	30			30	36				
D02			59	53					38	28
D03			68	62	48	52				
D04			45	36					45	44
D05			56	55	72	72				
D06			54	54					21	21
D07			55	60					19	28
D08			58	63	16	16				
D09										
D10			45	41	77	70				
D11			64	61					25	31
D12			59	58					55	53
D13			43	42	38	38				
D14	39	31					54	56		
D15	58	60								
D16			62	61			46	42		
D17			61	59					54	44
D18	40	43					20	19		
D19	37	36							36	44
D20	47	42							42	37
D21	25	24					44	41		
D22	25	20								
	302	286	729	705	281	284	164	158	335	330